

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

CENTER FOR FOOD SAFETY, ET AL.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

ALEX M. AZAR, ET AL.,

Defendants.

CASE NO. 18-cv-06299-YGR

**ORDER DENYING ADMINISTRATIVE
MOTION TO CONSIDER WHETHER CASES
SHOULD BE RELATED**

Re: Dkt. No. 36

Currently pending before the Court is defendants' administrative motion to consider whether, pursuant to Civil Local Rule 3-12, *Center for Food Safety v. Azar*, No. 3:19-cv-05168-VC ("*FSMA III*") should be related to closed case *Center for Food Safety v. Azar*, No. 4:18-cv-06299-YGR ("*FSMA II*"). (Dkt. No. 36.) Rule 3-12 provides an "action is related to another when: (1) The actions concern substantially the same parties, property, transaction or event; and (2) It appears likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different Judges."

Although there is overlap between the cases, the Court finds that is unlikely that there will be "unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or conflicting results" if *FSMA III* proceeds before a different judge. First, *FSMA II* is closed so there is no need to coordinate any proceedings. Second, this Court did not consider or rule on any substantive motions in *FSMA II*, and thus, there would be no judicial efficiency gained by relating the cases. Accordingly, defendants' motion is hereby **DENIED**.

This Order terminates Docket Number 36.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: December 5, 2019



YVONNE GONZALEZ ROGERS
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE